



MISINTERPRETATION OF THE “OPEN” CATEGORY AS NOT OPEN IN THE REALISTIC SENSE WITH CONTEXT TO SOCIAL RESERVATION SYSTEM IN INDIA

Deepak. P. Gaikwad, Ph. D

Programme Officer & Research Associate, Indian Institute of Education, Pune

Abstract

This paper an interdisciplinary project on “Critical Study of Social Reservation Policy with Special Reference to Reservation in Services and Education in Maharashtra” with regards to education and status of employment of Dalits Though the emphasis is on Social Reservation, this study inquires into the demands of social reservation of Dalits. Critics have claimed that though sixty years have passed with the implementation of social reservation, expected results with regards changes in social, political and economical life of Dalits have been not accrued in India. It is the same case with Maharashtra. We are dealing here with the need of the study of reservation in India. This paper deals with reservation and the making of Indian citizenship: Ambedkar’s critique of Gandhi in his What the Congress and Gandhi have done for the Untouchables. This part analyzes the problematic of reservation with Ambedkar’s program of the annihilation of caste.

Keywords: Social Reservation, Misinterpretation, Caste



[Scholarly Research Journal's](http://www.srjis.com) is licensed Based on a work at www.srjis.com

Introduction

This paper focuses on social reservation system in India. The point in this paper is to understand various types of social reservations: the reservation in school admission, the reservation in different government services and the reservation for women in government traveling buses

¹ (PMT).

Social reservation is intrinsically related to reservation in school admission and reservations in services for depress classes² in Indian society. In this paper I shall be highlighting the difference between political reservation and social reservation. This paper also focuses on the views of mass educators like B. R. Ambedkar, Jyotiba Phule, Rajershi Shahoo Maharaja and J. P. Naik, on education and social reservation. This paper

consequently explores the functioning of recruitments of teachers and professors in the Indian education system.

This paper focuses on the interpretation of the “Open” category in different types of social reservations. The word “OPEN” is a double meaning word. The word “Open” means something opens for all caste and groups. Another interpretation is someone who is not included in the reserve category, what happens in the misinterpretation of the “OPEN” category as not open in the realistic sense, but classified as another caste category within the caste hierarchy, so how does caste manipulate democracy?, How do binaries of orthodox caste thinking dominate over Indian liberal democratic imaginary? According to social reservation policy fifty percent reserve and fifty percent open means the last fifty percent is not reserve for any caste or category. This implies that this is OPEN to all people irrespective of caste or category; it is eligibly on merit basis.

In this study I have taken one case that is 50% department in university of Pune. I have studied what the status of these departments in the 50% OPEN seats is. Analysis will be on faculties³ coming from which caste. This paper also involve in comparative study between reservation in school admission, reservation in services and reservation for women in PMT buses.

This paper will be analyzing the work of B. R Ambedkar, Rajerhi Shahoo Maharaja, R.C. Sharma and J. P. Naik on the reservation policy. As case study, I am studying all departments of University of Pune to understand the dynamic of social reservation⁴.

A) The legacy of reservation:

Whilst the reservation policy has been hotly debated, except the neo-liberal economists who are not very favorable to this entire system of reservation, there has been no rigorously defined alternative to this system yet formulated. And because the legacy of reservation applied in colonial India it is also thought that a colonial basis could exist for this policy. Whilst after the introduction of the Indian Constitution, Dalits⁵ and other marginalized groups⁶ have got reservation in legislature and public sector⁷, yet results are not fully satisfying. In this paper I shall analyze whether Social Reservation really empowers the Dalits.

In colonial India many social reformers, mass educators has tried to development of weaker section⁸ of society through the education. Like Jyotiba Phule, Rajershi Shahoo maharaj, Babasahed Ambedkar and J.P Naik.

Jyotiba Phule:

Jyotiba Phule has not linked to directly social reservation but his work for the reservation. In other way I want say today's social reservation policy need for Dalit because of Phule and Other Mass Educator because if Dalit not got education then no need of any social reservation. So Dalit education is very important for social reservation.

According to Jyotiba Phule, "primary Education of masses should be made compulsory up to a certain age say least 12 years".⁹ One may refer to the 18 Oct 1882 Memorandum to the Hunter Commission in this regard. Phule has fought against castisim, he devoted his whole life foe mass education. According to Citratat Naik¹⁰ "Mhatma Phule says that the founder of the Earth is one, that's why the human being can not discrimination each other on the basis of Caste and religion."¹¹

Rajershi Shahoo Maharaja.

A slight note on this radical history of reservation is necessary. One knows that it was Shahoo Maharaj who started separate hostels in Kolhapur for students from the all communities and the boarding especially for the students from the untouchable communities. One also knows that he offered scholarships to the needy and intelligent students from the backward castes so that they could continue their education. He made primary education compulsory and free for all in his Princely State. His royal decree held up the cause of women's education. To abolish untouchability, He introduced reservation for the untouchables in government jobs.

Babasaheb Ambedkar:

Babasaheb Ambedkar and Reservation Policy as two side of coin which cannot divide each other. The reservation policy has impact of most famous pact, known as Puna Pact between M. K Gandhi and B. R Ambedkar. He played very important role in making of Indian Constitution. He mainly worked for women and Dalit freedom. He fought against untouchabliaty in whole life. He knows that Dalit has a weaker section of Society that's why he given some reservation to develop them. Ambedkar says in his book *Annihilation of Caste* that whilst caste is a form of "enclosed class' governed by the laws of graded inequality and division of laborers, his very modernist outlook also made him say that caste was also bound to the oppression of women.

That's why he focuses on freedom of women.

Social Reservation Policy, Education Policy and annihilation of Caste system have very important correlation. The view of B R Ambedkar for Social Reservation is if Dalit and women get Education easily then get Government services easily and develop social and economical status and do the intercaste marriage. That's why reduce the Caste System automatically. "The real remedy for breaking Caste is Inter-marriage nothing else will serve as the solvent of caste"¹²

J. P. Naik:

J. P Naik has not directly linked to Reservation Policy but he linked to education policy. He is famous mass educator in Pune or in india. He is founder of Indian Institute of Education, Pune. He has worked as member secretary of Education commission of India in 1964 to 1966 and educational advisor Government of India.

When I saw the Educational thought of J. P. Naik then I am attract two thought. One is Universal Education and second is common school, because if both thought implemented effectively then it's helpful to get the aim of social reservation. (Social, economical development of Dalit and annihilation of Caste)

When the people of all Caste and category has get education in one common school then definitely caste system going to an end.

R. C. Sharma:

R.C. Sharma is famous thinker. He is in favor of Reservation Policy. According to him,¹³ "The scheduled castes have been backward socially, economically and educationally. For quite a long time they have been subjected to various forms of social and economical exploitation. The Constitution of India, therefore, extended protection and safeguards for the scheduled caste either specially or by way of general rights of citizen for maintaining and promoting their educational and economic interest and removing certain social disabilities" If we study all above view of mass educator and social reformers then we understand the need and importance of social reservation. But the point is to understand today's reservation system.

B) Type of reservation:

Reservations are two types one is Political reservation and another is Social Reservation.

1) Political reservation

A brief history of political reservation needs being pointed out. It was the Poona Pact that Ambedkar was forced to sign under the duress of Gandhi in the aftermath of the three round table conferences in 1931-2 from whence the idea of Political Reservation emerged. This was Gandhi's way of negating Ambedkar's proposal for separate electorates for Dalits.

According to Gandhi, Ambedkar's proposal would dilute the unity of Hindu society and undermine the anti-colonial movement. Gandhi's fast in 1932 in the Yerwada jail, Pune that caused national tension, forced Ambedkar in giving in to Gandhi's demands. One can claim that this was some sort of social contract that emerged with the dominance of the Congress elites in the struggle for Indian independence.

In this sense one must differentiate the political ideology of Ambedkar and his philosophy of social emancipation and what emerges in the contemporary politics of reservation. One view one could classify as the "elitist" view as it appears as in the works of Centre for Policy Research. Panandiker the Founding Director of the Centre for Policy Research for example talks of the politics of backwardness in his book *The Politics of Backwardness* whilst Christophe Jafferlot talks of the "silent revolution" that the reservation policy has heralded, especially after the Mandal Commission.

1.1) Type of political reservation:

Political Reservation has two major types one is reservation in Member of Parliament and member of legislature assembly for SCs and STs, and another is reservation in Local Self Government for SCs, STs, OBCs and women.

2) Social reservation:

Another important type of reservation is Social Reservation. This reservation for SCs, STs, OBCs, Women etc, in School Admission and Government Services. The 50% quota for Reserve and other 50% are open for all caste including who get benefit of Reservation on eligibility of Merit.

The Indian Constitution gave the Reserve quota for backward caste¹⁴ in Indian society on basis of Caste because very much discrimination among the Caste in Indian Caste Hierarchy. SCs and STs has throughout from development Society and Policy like Education, They prohibited from right to speech, right to work, right to eat from the Indian Society. They had not freedom for occupy drinking water. That's why this reservation policy has on the basis of Caste.

2.2) Type of social reservation:

Social reservation has mainly two types one is reservation in School admission and other is reservation in Government Services. But I would like to include one more type of social reservation that is reservation for women in government traveling buses.

3. Comparative study or understanding of different type social reservation:

(Reservation in school admission, reservation in government services, and women reservation in PMT buses)

1) Reservation in School Admission:

There are 50% reserve seats in school, college and university for SCs, STs and OBC, etc. it's implemented very well because of its eligibility on Merit base¹⁵. But wherever the eligibility criteria is interview instead of merit of marks and grade there are not implemented social reservation policy as accepted in school admission. They fill reserve quota correctly but they don't fill open quota of 50% correctly. The interview comity gave highest marks or grade for upper caste¹⁶ as compare to reserve category. Theoretically they fill open quota of 50% on eligibility of merit but the question is this merit is created by interview comity which is doubtful.

2) Reservation in Government Services:

There are 50% reserve posts in every registered School, College, Institutions and University for SCs, STs and OBCs, etc.

The recruitment of Primary School Teacher¹⁷ is implemented very well both reserve and open quota, because there recruitment on the eligibility of D.ed marks and grade by the district collector.

The recruitment of college teacher and the faculty of various departments in Universities are implemented very doubtfully. These recruitments on eligibility of merit in interview not important of previous academic record. Indirectly these interview systems in services create a way to corruption. The interview comity selected those people who are favorable. But the point is that if forget the recruitments that how the candidate select and understand all recruitment as reserve seats and open seats. Then we know the reserve posts of 50% are filling by the interview comity. But the point is that other 50% open for all caste including reserve category are filled correctly. Then we under understand not filed correctly because the tradition is that The OPEN means not OPEN to all Caste it is only for non reserve caste. That's we seen the 50% OPEN post occupied or appointed by Upper Caste People¹⁸

3) Women Reservation in PMT buses:

Maharashtra State Transport has reserve 33% seats for women in their buses. Pune Municipal Corporation has reserve 50% seats for women in their buses. And its

implementation is very well with compare to above two type of reservation. The women have seat on OPEN seats as well as reserve seat for the traveling.

Women has right to do the empty seat form men who seat on reserve seats. Women have to fire the police case against the men in this type of matter. That's why it's implemented very well.



C. Case study of university of Pune:

I am chose Pune University as to understand of social reservation in services and open quota for of Castes.

If we see the table given bellow then we understand what status is of so called OPEN quota for all caste on the eligibility of merit. Is it really OPEN to all Caste? Or is it reserve only for non reserve Caste (open). In this table says all faculty, department fill reserve quota correctly but in OPEN quota of 50% seats are not reserve any Caste, which is eligible on merit. But I seen this table all faculty and departments filled OPEN as reserve for upper caste or non reserve caste because no one candidate selected from reserve category on this OPEN quota of 50%. There is highest percentage of Non reserve Caste in recruitment of this 50% OPEN quota.

Table: Percentage of Upper Caste¹⁹ in Open Post of faculty in Departments of Pune University

Sr. No	Faculty	Total post of Faculty	Total reserve Post	Total open post	% of Upper Caste in OPEN Post
1	M.M.S.S and Other	70	31	39	100%
2	Arts and Fine Arts	41	19	22	100%
3	Science	153	76	77	Around 90%

A) M.M.S.S (Mental, Moral and Social Science B) Other (Technology, Education, Management and law)

Source: www.unipune.ac.in / Departments

D. Facts, findings and conclusion:

The social reservation policy has hotly debated in this decade. The reservation policy has implemented correctly. But the problem is non reserve quota (OPEN) has not implemented correctly. It has dominant by Upper Caste (Non Reserve Caste).

The recruitment of Teacher, Faculty and other government services has not transparency. It is depend on the comity of interview. And the comity creates merit in favors of him. Just I want recommended to create a recruitment body in University level. The entire interview system should be ban. Because I think interview means not enter in view that is interview.

We listen from our friends and relatives. In School Admissions and services interviews asks the question. How much donation are you giving us? Another matter I listen from my friend, he want apply for OPEN post and he is from reserve category, when he going to apply the principle said “This post for open not for reserve caste, you can not apply” this is a reality. So the question is that the social reservation policy gives the 50% reservation for backward Caste or Upper Caste. Who is really benefiter of this social reservation policy?

¹ Government buses mean Pune Municipal Corporation buses.

² Depress class (SC, ST, OBC, Minorities, Women, Other)

³ Those who recruit on open post.

⁴ Only reservation in Government Services, School Admissions

⁵ Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe.

⁶ OBC, Women, Minorities and other who got benefit of reservation.

⁷ Public sector mean School and Government services.

⁸ Dalit and other marginalized groups

⁹ 18 Oct 1882 – A memorandum to the Hunter commission in *Bahujan Shikshan Vastav Ani Aapeksha* edited by Sarad Javdekar

and others, Publication: Aakhil Bhartiya Samajvadi Adhapak Sabha Pune , 2011 topic 20 page no 195

¹⁰ Well known thinker in Pune.

¹¹ See Desai, V. D, “Mahatma Jyotiba Phule”(Pune, Indian Institute of Education, 1992).

¹² Annihilation of Caste in *The Essential Writings of B. R. Ambedkar*, Edited by Velerian Rudrigues, (New Delhi; Oxford University Press, 2008)

¹³ I refer in *The Studies in educational reforms in India volume III* Edited by P.R.

Panchamukhi (Indian Institute of Education, Pune 1989), chapter 3 *Concessions and Incentives to Educational Institutes for S.C. Student at School stage in Rajasthan* page no 67.

¹⁴ Socially and economically backward caste in Indian Caste System.

¹⁵ Marks and Grads of Pervious Academic year

¹⁶ Not take benefit of reservation.

¹⁷ I refer as 1st to 4th, 5th to 7th and 8th to 10th Class Teacher in Government School.

¹⁸ Not included reserve category.

¹⁹ Not included reserve category.

References

- Desai, V. D. (1992). Mahatma Jyotiba Phule. pune: Indian Institute of Education, Pune.*
- Javadekar, S. (2011). Bahujan Kshikshan Vastav ani Apeksha. Pune: Aakhil Bartiy SaMajwadi Adyapak Sabha.*
- Panchmukhi, P. R. (1989). The Studies in Educational Reforms in India volume III. Pune: Indian Institute of Education, Pune.*
- SPPU, P. (2016, March Monday 14). Retrieved from [www.unipune.ac.in / Departments](http://www.unipune.ac.in/Departments)*
- Velerian, R. E. (2008). Annihilation of Caste in The Essential Writings of B. R. Ambedkar. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.*